

**Terms of Reference**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Project title: | Professionalisation of Adult Education Centers in Armenia and Georgia |
| Country: | Armenia and Georgia |
| Funding agency: | German Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) |

# Introduction

DVV International is the Institute for International Cooperation of the Deutscher Volkshochschul-Verband e.V. (DVV), the German Adult Education Association. DVV represents the interests of approximately 920 adult education centres (Volkshochschulen) and their state associations, the largest service provider of continuing education in Germany. As the leading professional organisation in the field of adult education and development cooperation, DVV International has committed itself to supporting lifelong learning for 50 years now. DVV International provides worldwide support for the establishment and development of sustainable structures for a lifelong Adult Learning and Education (ALE).

Funded in a large part by the BMZ for the creation/strengthening of social structures (Sozialstrukturförderung - SSF), the Institute cooperates with more than 200 partners in more than 30 countries in Africa, Asia, Latin America and Europe. DVV International promotes, together with national, regional and global associations of adult education (AE), lobbying and advocacy activities for the human right to education and lifelong learning. In doing so, DVV International contributes to the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), the Global Agenda for Education (Education 2030) and the UNESCO International Conferences on Adult Education (CONFINTEA).

DVV International supports the exchange of information and interaction between professionals at European and global level through conferences, seminars and publications. DVV International's interventions cover three levels: *first level* – contribution to policies, strategies, standards and norms, as well as funding on national level (macro level), *second level* – institutional capacity building and capacity building of teaching staff (meso level), and, *third level* - the basic model interventions for the population with potential for replication at national, regional, and international level (micro level).

# Background of the project

## Armenia[[1]](#footnote-1)

DVV International Armenia Country Office (DVVI Armenia) was established in 2002 and has evolved in the last two decades into a key player with respect to introducing and enhancing ALE and LLL in Armenia through the funding of German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ). To promote adult learning and education in Armenia, DVV Armenia has worked in three key directions - 1) advocacy for policy and systemic change (macro), 2) capacity building of ALE organizations and professionals (meso), and 3) pilot testing of ALE initiatives and projects for end beneficiaries through 4 Adult Education Centres (micro), including:

1. Support to ALE policies & strategies: advocacy for ALE as a separate sub-sector of education in relevant laws, strategies, government programs; implementation of various research and studies, etc.
2. Institutional & professional capacity building: trainings of trainers, establishment of a non-formal network of ALE providers, study visits, mentorship and consultancy for the AECs, partnerships between public and private ALE providers and the AECs, etc.
3. New opportunities for beneficiaries through AECs: during the past 15 years, 5 Adult Education Centres have been supported by DVV International Armenia. In parallel to hundreds of trainings for development of vocational skills required by the job market, Adult Education Centres have implemented numerous other activities including discussions, public hearings, community initiatives thus promoting civic participation and community involvement among AEC’s beneficiaries and community residents․

## Georgia

DVV International Georgia Country Office was established in 2002. With a considerable part of the Georgian population having yet to integrate into the country’s young market economy, education for poverty reduction, active civic participation, and long-term development remains at the forefront of DVVI’s agenda.

Already for years in a row, DVVI follows a threefold strategy. On one side it supports the institutional development of the education sector and its relevant actors. On the other side, DVVI implements direct delivery projects that address issues of poverty and a sustainable environment. At the same time, DVVI tries to draw more political attention to somehow neglected Adult Education (AE) and development issues.

As the leading professional organisation in the field of AE, DVV International strives to introduce Georgia to the principles, values, and practices of Lifelong Learning (LLL) which are essential for enabling citizens to pursue opportunities for themselves, their communities, and the whole country.

The overarching aim of DVV International Georgia is to foster the enduring development of the non-formal AE system. To that end, the European model — with an emphasis on the German Volkshochschule— was tailored to the peculiarities of the Georgian populace.

# Objectives of the programme

Generally speaking, the objectives of the interventions of DVV International in both countries are the same as it is about promoting Adult Education. More specifically, the objective of this programme is: *Adult education as an integral part of the education sector in the Caucasus Region contributes to the sustainable development of the country and the well-being of the population*.

The following are general objectives of DVV International.

1. Adult education offers are improved and multiplied (micro level);
2. The technical and institutional capacities of the cooperation partners for carrying out practical activities and for the management of a system are reinforced (meso level);
3. The inclusion of adult education in policies, poverty reduction strategies and local and national budgets has increased (macro level).

# Activities of the programme

## Armenia

To achieve its macro level goals and objectives in the target period(s), DVVI Armenia’s efforts have been directed in three main directions, including:

* Research and data collection /analysis to enhance evidence-based ALE policy making in Armenia;
* Increased ALE awareness in Armenia on policy maker and general public level;
* Recognition of the role ALE plays in modern societies and the inclusion of ALE as a separate sub-section in government and education programs, strategies, etc.

The following indicators have been formulated to verify the achievement of these objectives:

1.1. At least one draft policy recommendations document/legislative package exists addressing ALE as a stand-alone area using UNESCO and EU ALE terminology (end 2023).

1.2. The 2021 Adult Education Survey on ALE will be used by the National Statistical Office and/or survey agencies at national level as a model for at least one follow-up survey until 2024.

1.3. At least one national campaign and two annual events / measures on ALE have been implemented.

2.1 The new education strategy and action plan have been adopted until the end of 2022.

2.2 Implementation/introduction of at least two selected ALE elements (such as recognition of prior learning, development of ALE) have been supported.

## Georgia

With the objective of making adult education an integral part of the country's education sector and fostering sustainable development of structures for adult education, DVVI Georgia has focused its efforts in several key directions:

1. Research and Data Collection/Analysis to enhance evidence-based Adult Learning and Education (ALE) policy making in the country.
2. Structured Capacity Building programme at both the state and regional levels (Government of Georgia and municipal authorities) to increase their awareness and skills in supporting ALE initiatives.
3. Facilitation of dialogue among decision-makers, ALE institutions, and communities to foster joint efforts in strengthening the development of adult education in the country.
4. Advocacy and Lobbying Initiatives for the establishment of an ALE division within the Ministry of Education and Science, aiming to create a dedicated focus on adult education.
5. Participation in Strategic Document Developmentsuch as the Vocational Education Strategy, Labor and Employment Strategy, Main Directions of Development of Education and Science, and more.

For the current phase (2022 -2024) the following indicators have been formulated to verify the achievement of these objectives:

1.1 A policy document or strategy on adult learning is developed and published.

1.2 Funding mechanisms to support ALE are included as a separate part/chapter in the adult learning policy document (or strategy).

# Evaluation goal and objectives

DVV International understands itself as a learning organization. In order to improve further project activities, DVV International, as the implementing agency, would like to learn more about achievements, challenges and best practices of the above-mentioned project.

## Armenia

The evaluation will examine the work carried out by DVVI Armenia at macro level in 2021-2023 period. This period covers parts of the previous (2019-2021) and current (2022-2024) 3-year program phases and as such will address how objectives identified by DVVI Armenia for macro level at respective periods were met, including:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 2019-2021 | * The framework conditions and offers of the ALE in Armenia have been analysed and the shortcomings identified.
* ALE strategic priorities have been identified in discussions with the government and other ALE stakeholders
 |
| 2022-2024 | * Better ALE policy making based on improved national statistics on ALE and increased public awareness of ALE
 |

\*Each of these goals/objectives has measurable indicators to track progress that are included in the Project planning matrix and reported annually

***The goal of this assignment is to assess whether and to what extent the objectives defined by DVVI Armenia at the macro level have been reached, indicators met and results achieved***.

More specifically, the evaluation team should:

* Review DVVI Armenia’s interventions at macro level in the identified period, assess them against the defined objectives, document accomplishments and progress, identify gaps and areas for further improvement /interventions.
* Provide recommendations about the macro level intervention in the next three years based on the accomplishments and gaps analysis as well as study of best international practice in the countries that are somewhat comparable to Armenia in their socio-economic, geo-political, demographic characteristics

## Georgia

For sustainable strengthening of adult education, the project intended to contribute at the **macro level** to create a positive policy environment for lifelong learning with a focus on ALE. The evaluation will examine whether DVV International has succeeded in engaging with the political field at the macro level and whether it has been able to influence the political environment to make ALE a part of the Georgian education system. It is not only the federal level that should be considered, as the municipal level is also crucial in shaping the framework for ALE and should be included in the evaluation. The evaluation should review and assess the relevance of the project activities, the achievement of the expected results, and their perspectives for sustainability. It should include a reflection about **lessons learnt** and make **recommendations** for the project counterparts regarding methodologies, strategies, and approaches for possible further activities. The evaluation is aimed at revealing problems and barriers in the project implementation, as well as outlining how they can be overcome. The objectives and impacts will be evaluated on the basis of the information laid out in the Logical Framework Matrix.

The evaluation and its recommendations shall be a useful tool of information for the project implementing agency – DVV International and its partners.

# Main Evaluation questions

The evaluation has to be carried out according to the OECD DAC Criteria for Evaluation Development Assistance and should give clear statements regarding the following:

## Relevance

The extent to which the aid activity is suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient and donor. In evaluating the relevance of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

### Armenia

* To what extent do the objectives defined at the macro level by DVVI Armenia (for 2019-2021 and 2022-2024 program phases) reflect the situation with ALE policies /strategies /systems /practices in Armenia and are designed to contribute to improvements of the entire enabling environment thereof?
* To what extent have the interventions implemented in 2021-2023 period taken into account the views and positions of the different stakeholders of existing ALE policies /strategies /systems in Armenia?
* What are the effects /benefits of cooperation between state actors and DVVI Armenia?

### Georgia

* Are the activities and outputs of the programme consistent with the macro level objectives?
* Has DVV International been able to reach out to the relevant stakeholders in the field?
* What are the effects /benefits of cooperation between state actors and DVVI Georgia?

## Effectiveness

A measure of the extent to which an aid activity attains its objectives. In evaluating the effectiveness of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

### Armenia

* Are there any observable effects linked to interventions on the macro level? How successful have the interventions been in achieving the defined objectives that led to such effects?
* What are the quantitative and qualitative effects of the interventions on the macro level? Were the relevant results /indicators defined in the Project Planning Matrix (PPM) fully met?
* Are the indicators formulated in the PPM useful for planning, implementation and evaluation or is there any need for improvement in this area?

### Georgia

* To what extent were the objectives achieved / are likely to be achieved?
* What were the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?

### Armenia/Georgia

* What are the major gaps with respect to data /statistics needs for evidence-based policy making, legislative /policy /system reforms and how can those be addressed to improve the ALE sector?
* What are other challenges hindering the effectiveness of the interventions (if any)?
* What are the unexpected positive (also negative) results and effects, if any?

## Efficiency

Efficiency measures the outputs -- qualitative and quantitative -- in relation to the inputs. It is an economic term which signifies that the aid uses the least costly resources possible in order to achieve the desired results. This generally requires comparing alternative approaches to achieving the same outputs, to see whether the most efficient process has been adopted. When evaluating the efficiency of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

### Armenia/Georgia

* To what extent have the interventions at macro level been cost effective? Are the benefits associated with the interventions proportionate to the cost?
* To what extent are the costs of the interventions associated with different stakeholder groups proportionate with the distribution of the generated benefits?
* Was the programme or project implemented in the most efficient way compared to alternatives?

## Impact

The positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. This involves the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental and other development indicators. The examination should be concerned with both intended and unintended results and must also include the positive and negative impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions. When evaluating the impact of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

### Armenia

* To what extent are the measures /intervention on macro level goal-oriented and impact-oriented?
* To what extent have the macro level interventions contributed or are likely to contribute to long-term policy and systemic changes in ALE sub-sector in Armenia?
* Which good practices /trends /developments exist that have a positive impact on policy and legislative development for ALE in Armenia? How can further interventions capitalize on those?

### Georgia

* What has happened as a result of the programme or project?
* Have the activities of DVV International made any sustaining impact on the macro level stakeholders?
* Have the activities of DVV International made any sustaining impact on the development in ALE in the country?

## Sustainability

Sustainability is concerned with measuring whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn. Projects need to be environmentally as well as financially sustainable. When evaluating the sustainability of a programme or a project, it is useful to consider the following questions:

### Armenia/Georgia

* How successful were the interventions in establishing mechanisms to ensure durability of results?
* How likely are the effects resulting from the interventions to be sustained in the longer term and ensure an effective ALE system?
* How could further system-building and increased financing from public resources in the field of ALE be fostered? Will the benefits of the programme continue after donor funding ceased?
* What were the major factors which influenced the achievement or non-achievement of sustainability of the programme?
* Are there general or specific recommendations for further work on the macro level and for comparable measures and objectives for the future?

## Coherence

A lack of coherence can lead to duplication of efforts and undermine overall progress. Adding the criteria will help raise the bar on analysis of these important issues. Coherence deals with the compatibility of the intervention with other interventions in a country, sector or institution.

### Armenia

* To what extent have different interventions implemented in the target period at macro level been coherent, complementary and how did the interlinkages between different activities /interventions contribute to the three main directions of DVVI’s work at the macro level that is also reflected in the specific objectives of the three-year plans?
* To what extent have different interventions implemented in the target period at macro level been coherent with other developments in Armenia and globally with respect to legislative and system changes in education (including non-formal ALE) and other related areas (e.g., employment /labor market, local government, etc.), if any?

### Georgia

* Internal coherence:
	+ - Are there synergies and interlinkages between the intervention and other interventions carried out by the same institution?
* External coherence:
	+ - Are the interventions consistent, harmonized and coordinated with the interventions of other actors in the same context?
		- Do the interventions complement each other?
		- Are duplication of efforts being avoided?

# Evaluation approach and methods

The evaluation will consist of both desk and field study. A combination of primary data collection and secondary data review is expected during the evaluation.

Secondary data sources will be made available to the contractor. The following **secondary documents** will be provided:

* Project application with logframe
* Annual plans and annual reports
* Interim project reports
* Mid-term and other kinds of (self)evaluations referring to the project
* Partner documents of project implementation (as far as available)
* Etc.

To collect information from **primary data sources**, the contractor is free to propose feasible methodological approaches (quantitative or qualitative) as well as suggest additional stakeholders to be included in the data collection. We recommend taking the following groups into consideration (more can be added depending on the methodological approach of the evaluation team):

Management of regional and country office of DVV I in Armenia and Georgia

Macro level partners including:

Stakeholders from federal governmental institutions

Stakeholders from municipal governmental institutions (in different regions)

Effectiveness with regard to the objective:

Management of Adult Education Centers,

It should be checked if standardized quantitative approaches might be applicable.

The evaluation will begin with an inception phase of reviewing documents provided by DVV International (desk study), and the preparation of an inception report. This is followed by a period of field study and the preparation of a draft report. The final report will consider remarks to the draft report made by the DVV International country, regional office, and regional desk at headquarters.

# Indicative Timetable

* Deadline for clarifications: August 21, 2023
* **Deadline of submission of proposals: August 27, 2023**
* Selection of candidate: early September, 2023
* Inception Report (Draft): late September, 2023
* Field phase: October, 2023
* First draft of evaluation report mid November October, 2023
* Final version of Evaluation Report: Late November, 2023

# Target group of the evaluation results

The target group of the evaluation results will be the project management team of DVV International country and regional office as well as the head office in Bonn. The results of the evaluation will also be sent to the Contracting Authority (BMZ).

# Right of use

DVV International has the exclusive and unlimited right to use the results fulfilled by the contract. The transfer of this Right of Use is complete with the payment made to the Contractor.

The Contractor has Right of Use permission strictly limited for personal non-commercial purposes. Transfer of the Right of Use to third parties is excluded.

# Contractual Conditions

The legal basis for this contract is provided by the „General terms and conditions for the implementation of Services" (VOL/B). These general terms and conditions are not attached to this contract; however, an exemplary service contract is part of these Terms of Reference for perusal.

# Tasks of the evaluator/ evaluation team

The evaluation team will be requested to fulfill the following tasks:

* Methodological design and planning of the evaluation in communication with DVV International;
* Desk Study of relevant project documentation (application and logframe, annual plans and reports, other monitoring documents and project reports, teaching and PR material);
* Design of data collection instruments for the field phase;
* Prepare an Inception Report;
* Conduct the field phase with participation and involvement of all relevant stakeholders;
* Compile preliminary evaluation report, integrate comments, and finalize the report.
* De-briefing sessions in Tbilisi/Georgia.

# Deliverables

The following deliverables are expected:

* **Inception report**: The expert/ team of experts will present a report giving detailed information about methods and specified questions (evaluation matrix); all data collection tools need to be presented beforehand. In case of applying quantitative data collection methods, a pre-test will be required. This report will be presented to DVV International; DVV International will provide feedback in due time and may request amendments. The Inception Report needs to be approved by DVV International before the data collection commences.
* **Debriefing in the country**: By arrangement with the DVV International programme coordinator, the (team of) expert(s) will present the preliminary, country-specific results of the evaluation and will answer questions in this regard, documenting the discussion, which must form part of the final report.
* **Draft evaluation report**: DVV International will receive a first draft of the final report, which will be examined on the basis of the DAC Evaluation Quality Standards; on this basis, comments will be made on the rough draft before it is returned to the expert(s).
* **Final evaluation report**: The final report will take into account the comments on the rough draft about the entire evaluation process and all results and recommendations.

The evaluation report should be produced **in English** submitted to DVV International **electronically**. A respective template for the final report will be provided in the inception phase to the contractor.

# Responsible persons at DVV International and logistics

DVV International will be the contracting authority for this evaluation. The main contact persons will be

* The senior manager for M&E Mrs. Maja Avramovska, DVV International, Bonn
* The senior desk officer for Europe Mrs. Bettina Brand of DVV International in Bonn
* DVV International’s Regional Director for Caucasus and South-East Europe Mr. Thomas Lichtenberg
* DVV International Country Director for Armenia Mrs. Ester Hakobyan.
* DVV International Country Director for Georgia Mrs. Lali Santeladze.

The DVV country offices will provide all relevant documents and support the evaluator/ team of evaluators in the field with arranging interviews and field visits etc.

The final report will be accepted by the senior manager for monitoring and evaluation and the senior desk officer for Europe of DVV International in Bonn.

# Evaluator eligibility criteria

The evaluation will be done by an evaluator or a team of evaluators who need to demonstrate experience in evaluating development projects. Previous experience in Armenia and Georgia and knowledge of Georgian and Armenian language will be considered as an asset.

The consultant(s) we are looking for should

* have at least 5-year experience in the field of evaluation of development projects (please, provide proof of this experience);
* be able to demonstrate sound knowledge of evaluation methods and instruments;
* have experience in the field of adult education,
* analytical and writing skills;
* previous working experience in Armenia/Georgia is an asset;
* fluency in English. Fluency in and Armenian/Georgian is an asset;

#  Quality standards

The candidates should propose a suitable evaluation design and methodology, well adapted to the project objectives and TOR for the evaluation, in order to meet the evaluation’s goal and objectives.

The evaluation must comply with the following standards and guidelines:

* OECD-DAC Principles for Evaluation of Development Assistance[[2]](#footnote-2)
* Standards of the DeGEval – Gesellschaft für Evaluation Standards für Evaluation[[3]](#footnote-3)

# Coordination/Responsibility

The Senior Desk Officer for Europe as well as the Senior Desk Officer for Monitoring and Evaluation at DVV International Headquarters in Bonn will be in charge of the contracting. The evaluator should work in close cooperation with DVV International Country Director in Yerevan/Armenia and Tbilisi/Georgia during the preparatory and implementation phase. The Project Coordinator from DVV International Country Office in Armenia and Georgia will handle the cooperation regarding the exchange of relevant project documentation and data.

Logistical support will be offered to the evaluator by the Project team in the countries (DVV International country office staff), including booking of accommodation, local transportation, translation and assistance in arranging interviews and project visits.

# Estimated Budget

The estimated cost of the assignment is **9.500 EUR** (including taxes), including honorarium, per diems, travel and transportation costs of the Evaluator.

# Application package

Experts participating in the tender for this evaluation should send the application package by **latest 27th August** by e-mail to:

Maja Avramovska, Senior Manager on Monitoring and Evaluation at DVV International Headquarters in Bonn) e-mail address: avramovska@dvv-international.de

Dr. Thomas Lichtenberg, Regional Director for Caucasus and Southeastern Europe, DVV International, Lichtenberg@dvv-international.de

Ester Hakobyan, Country Director Armenia, DVV International, e-mail address: hakobyan@dvv-international.am

Lali Santeladze, Country Director Georgia, DVV International, e-mail address: santeladze@dvv-international.ge

Late submissions will not be accepted.

The application package should include the following documents. Please make sure to comply to the provided requirements below and use the **annexed templates**:

All interested candidates should submit the following documents:

1. CV(s) of person(s) to be involved in the assignment in English (Please use the template provided);
2. Technical proposal covering the following aspects (**maximum of 5 pages**);
	* Narrative overview displaying an understanding of the task
	* Detailed methodology
	* Work Plan, including detailed proposed steps of implementation
	* Consideration of any specific requirements envisaged for the evaluation
	* Consideration of the specific context (country, topic)
	* Internal Quality Management
3. A detailed financial proposal with all expected costs (Please use the template provided and submit with **a hand-written signature**).

# Evaluation criteria of proposals

The proposals will be assessed according to the following criteria:

* **Qualifications of the evaluation team** (**counts one third**) (based on criteria mentioned above);
* **Technical proposal (counts one third)** (based on criteria mentioned above; all of the above mentioned criteria for technical proposals will be taken into account)**;**
* **Financial proposal (counts one third)** (best cost-service relation; please consider the envisaged total number of working days).

# Request for clarification

If you should have questions concerning this tender, please send your questions to hakobyan@dvv-international.am and santeladze@dvv-international.ge mentioned as contact persons above. The latest date for submitting questions is 21st August 2023. The answers to the questions will be published on our website (<https://www.dvv-international.de/dvv-international/stellenangebote/>) for all interested parties the following day.

1. More information about DVV International and DVVI Armenia/DVV Georgia is available at the following links:

<https://www.dvv-international.de>, [www.dvv-international.am](http://www.dvv-international.am), [www.dvv-international.ge](http://www.dvv-international.ge) [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. <http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/qualitystandardsfordevelopmentevaluation.htm> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. <https://www.degeval.org/publikationen/standards-fuer-evaluation/> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)